

NCQA Quality Scores – State Averages for Medicaid, Medicare, and Private Health Plans

Five Slide Series, Volume 9
February 2014

The Menges Group

www.themengesgroup.com

703-942-8104

Summary of Our Methodology

- We worked with NCQA's 2013 published ranking of MCOs
 - Tabulated data separately for Medicaid, Medicare, and Private health plans
 - These rankings & quality scores are available at: <http://healthplanrankings.ncqa.org>
- We grouped the health plans by state and calculated average NCQA quality scores by state
 - For plans serving multiple states, a “primary state” was estimated so that each NCQA rating applied to just a single state in our tabulations
 - Nationwide the tabulations included 131 Medicaid MCOs, 338 Medicare MCOs, and 400 Private health plans
- States were ranked by their health plans' average scores for each population group
- Our comparisons include only NCQA-rated health plans.
 - Many health plans are not NCQA-rated -- their quality performance statistics are not systematically tracked and independently verified

Average 2013 NCQA Quality Scores: Top-Ranked States

STATE	Number of NCQA Rated Health Plans			Average NCQA Quality Score			State Ranking in Average NCQA Score			
	Medicaid	Medicare	Private	Medicaid	Medicare	Private	Medicaid	Medicare	Private	Average Rank
Massachusetts	5	7	14	86.1	81.9	86.7	1	5	1	2.3
Rhode Island	2	1	3	85.5	85.3	82.8	2	1	9	4.0
Vermont			4			84.1			4	4.0
Pennsylvania	8	16	19	81.2	81.9	83.1	7	4	6	5.7
Hawaii	3	8	4	81.4	77.5	85.4	6	14	2	7.3
New York	6	31	18	82.1	76.7	83.1	4	16	7	9.0
District of Columbia	1		3	80.9		81.9	10		14	12.0
Minnesota	2	6	5	83.5	73.7	83.1	3	25	8	12.0
Connecticut		6	8		73.7	84.6		24	3	13.5
Maryland	6	1	14	80.8	78.9	81.6	12	12	17	13.7
Ohio	7	15	17	77.0	79.2	82.1	22	9	11	14.0
New Jersey	2	4	9	81.2	73.8	82.1	9	23	12	14.7
Virginia	6	6	11	80.2	75.5	82.2	15	19	10	14.7
Maine		3	4		76.0	82.0		18	13	15.5
Tennessee	7	2	9	80.8	77.1	81.0	11	15	21	15.7
Michigan	12	10	13	79.9	79.4	79.5	16	8	27	17.0
Kentucky	4	5	7	77.8	82.1	79.5	21	3	28	17.3
Texas	2	16	12	82.1	73.2	80.1	5	26	24	18.3

Average 2013 NCQA Quality Scores: Mid-Ranked States

STATE	Number of NCQA Rated Health Plans			Average NCQA Quality Score			State Ranking in Average NCQA Score			
	Medicaid	Medicare	Private	Medicaid	Medicare	Private	Medicaid	Medicare	Private	Average Rank
North Carolina		5	6		73.9	81.7		22	16	19.0
Wisconsin	3	13	18	73.0	78.6	81.7	30	13	15	19.3
Florida	11	24	15	75.5	76.6	80.6	24	17	22	21.0
Indiana	4	7	6	79.5	74.9	79.8	17	20	26	21.0
Iowa		3	11		79.1	78.7		10	32	21.0
West Virginia	3	1	4	73.8	82.4	76.8	25	2	38	21.7
Georgia	3	10	11	80.7	72.3	81.4	14	34	18	22.0
Illinois	1	14	14	57.4	78.9	80.1	33	11	23	22.3
Delaware	2		7	81.2		77.2	8		37	22.5
New Hampshire		1	6		68.6	83.9		41	5	23.0
Missouri	2	5	11	78.5	72.8	81.0	20	32	20	24.0
Arkansas		1	2		80.0	76.0		6	43	24.5
Utah	1	5	4	80.7	73.1	78.7	13	28	33	24.7
California	10	26	17	73.7	70.9	81.3	26	36	19	27.0
South Carolina	3	3	6	79.4	71.4	79.5	18	35	29	27.3
New Mexico	6	9	8	78.8	73.0	77.9	19	29	35	27.7
Colorado	2	9	10	68.5	73.1	79.9	32	27	25	28.0
Kansas		1	7		79.6	73.4		7	50	28.5
Arizona		12	10		72.8	78.9		31	30	30.5

Average 2013 Quality Scores: Bottom-Ranked States

STATE	Number of NCQA Rated Health Plans			Average NCQA Quality Score			State Ranking in Average NCQA Score			
	Medicaid	Medicare	Private	Medicaid	Medicare	Private	Medicaid	Medicare	Private	Average Rank
Washington	2	15	8	73.6	74.2	75.0	27	21	46	31.3
Nevada	1	8	6	76.7	68.9	78.1	23	40	34	32.3
Oregon	1	11	7	73.4	72.5	77.2	28	33	36	32.3
Oklahoma		4	4		69.7	78.8		39	31	35.0
Mississippi	1	2	3	68.6	66.9	76.2	31	43	41	38.3
Nebraska	2		5	73.3		74.4	29		48	38.5
Alabama		4	2		70.2	76.5		38	40	39.0
Idaho		3	4		72.9	74.3		30	49	39.5
Montana		1	3		68.5	76.7		42	39	40.5
South Dakota			2			76.2			42	42.0
Louisiana		4	5		70.3	72.8		37	51	44.0
North Dakota			1			76.0			44	44.0
Wyoming			2			75.5			45	45.0
Alaska			1			74.8			47	47.0
USA Total	131	338	400	78.4	75.3	80.5				

State Quality Comparisons -- Summary Findings

- Nationwide, the average NCQA score was 80.5 for Private plans, 78.4 for Medicaid plans, and 75.3 for Medicare plans
- States that rank well in one payer sector (e.g. Medicare) tend to also rank well in others
 - Three states rank among top ten in all three sectors: Massachusetts, Rhode Island, and Pennsylvania
 - There are only a few instances where a state ranks in the top five in one sector but not in the top 20 in any other sector
- It appears the geographic area itself plays a role in the health plans' quality scores
 - Underlying provider and patient behaviors are likely contributing factors to the scores health plans are achieving
 - The same health plan investment in staff and systems to achieve optimal HEDIS scores, for example, will likely yield different results in different geographic areas